GENDER WORK IN TRADE UNIONS

MALE CHAMPIONS OF GENDER EQUALITY

Final report assignment commissioned by Union to Union
3rd of April 2016, Annica Holmberg
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BWI</td>
<td>Building and Wood Workers International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COSATU</td>
<td>Congress of South African Trade Unions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IndustriALL</td>
<td>IndustriALL Global Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITUC</td>
<td>International Trade Union Confederation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IUF</td>
<td>The International Union of Food, Agricultural, Hotel, Restaurant, Catering, Tobacco and Allied Workers' Associations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KUSPAW</td>
<td>The Kenya Union of Sugar Plantation Agricultural Workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LO</td>
<td>Swedish Trade Union Confederation/Landsorganisationen I Sverige</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGBTI</td>
<td>Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Intersex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUPAAW</td>
<td>The National Union of Plantation, Agricultural and Allied Workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OHSE</td>
<td>Occupational Health and Safety Environment initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSI</td>
<td>Public Services International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saco</td>
<td>Swedish Confederation of Professional Associations/Sveriges akademikers centralorganisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sida</td>
<td>Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWHAP</td>
<td>The Swedish Workplace HIV/AIDS Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TCO</td>
<td>Swedish Confederation of Professional Employees/Tjänstemännens Centralorganisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ToR</td>
<td>Terms of Reference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADP</td>
<td>Dominican Teachers’ Association/Asociación Dominicana de Profesores</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Executive summary

This report looks into trade unions’ work with male affiliates to promote gender equality, as well as the factors that drive male gender champions within the trade union movement. The study has examined whether there are unions within Union to Union’s global network that address gender equality from a more articulated men and masculinity perspective. The report is based on interviews with leaders and staff at national and global trade unions and a desk review.

The findings suggest that initiatives focusing on male behaviour and the role of male champions as a strategy to promote gender equality are still very much pioneer work. Few unions have used targeted actions with focus on men or masculinities in their gender equality initiatives. There is however a growing number of male unionists with a strong commitment to gender equality. The study suggests that there are several thematic areas where unions could deepen their discussions on how masculinity norms can be obstacles for increased gender equality. Initiatives aimed at changing decision-making structures and leadership within trade unions, as well as gendered labour rights and work environment issues, would benefit from a more norm critical approach. A stronger focus on men, the behaviour of male affiliates and men’s roles in gender equality at work and within trade unions should, however, be combined with continuous support for the empowerment of women workers and unionists.

The interviewed unionists support a strong focus on gender capacity building initiatives that target both female and male affiliates, making gender equality a core issue of the union work. Unions that have invested in longer gender studies, allowing members to reflect on their own behaviour, their role within the union, and in society at large, show interesting results. The report recommends future gender equality initiatives to be based on long-term processes that include participatory and active methods as well as in-depth feminist and norm-critical studies. Other recommendations are:

- When developing and introducing new gender strategies and methods, ensure that these are backed by a formal decision at a high level within the unions.
- Support male champions, or men in central functions, to connect and build alliances with gender and women’s rights activists within trade unions as well as in other social movements. The development of norm-changing strategies needs to be fostered in a feminist environment.
- Support networking and experience sharing between the pilot initiatives on men and masculinities that exist in different unions, as well as between these initiatives and the work of male gender equality activists in other movements.
- Link unions’ work regarding parental leave for both women and men to the experiences of organisations and activists that engage men in gender work.
- Explore the possibility of promoting gender projects that focus on work environment issues and risks at the workplace by looking into how masculinity and femininity norms increase the risk of accidents and abuse.
- Make use of the transformative nature of gender equality work to also include alliance building with other social movements, visualizing the role the trade union movement can play as a promoter of gender equality in society at large.
1. Introduction

The purpose of this report is to “give input to a ‘different methodology’ ” to achieve gender equality, mainly through male champions for gender equality and strategic work. The study has tried to find examples of unions that have been working on changing male behaviour/roles as a strategy to promote gender equality within the unions, among unions affiliates, at workplaces, or in society in general. The study has examined whether there are unions within Union to Union’s network that have started to address gender equality from a more articulated men and masculinity perspective. Finally, the study has also tried to find initiatives that challenge discrimination against LGBTI workers.

A “men and masculinities” approach to promoting equality between the sexes focuses on how to address the male side of gender equality, including the ways gender roles and stereotypes affect men and boys’ identities, behaviours and expected roles and responsibilities.

Trade unions have promoted gender equality both within their own structures and as a labour rights issue for a long time. As with other social movements, the struggle for gender equality has mainly focused on women’s empowerment and on women’s rights, which for unions has meant conditions and positions at the workplace and within unions. The work includes specific women’s initiatives to increase the number of female members, to strengthen their roles and/or to gender mainstream policies, negotiations, capacity building programmes and other union actions. Global unions and the International Labour Organization (ILO) have produced a number of key documents and policies to promote gender equality and to challenge gender discrimination. ILO has a two-pronged approach to gender equality under the Decent Work Agenda, promoting both gender mainstreaming and targeted interventions. This is also how many global and national trade unions address gender equality. The targeted interventions are, as already stated, women-oriented.

Many local, national and global unions have also contributed to raising awareness on women’s rights to the broader public, particularly regarding the consequences of the sex-divided job market. This work continues to be the foundation of gender equality work within trade unions over the globe. Much of the effort to promote gender equality is driven by female union activists, women committees and gender coordinators at local to global levels. Recognising their hard work for increased gender equality, this study takes a look at how male union affiliates and male leaders join forces in the struggle for women’s labour rights and gender equality at the workplace, within the unions and in society at large.

Union to Union and gender equality

Union to Union is a co-operation body founded by the Swedish Trade Union Confederation (LO), the Swedish Confederation of Professional Employees (TCO) and the Swedish Confederation of Professional Associations (Saco) for international trade union development cooperation, funded by the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Sida. The cooperation between LO, TCO and Saco together with their affiliated members, and International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC), the Global Union Federations or directly with national or regional trade unions, aim at

---

1 “When men change their gender behaviour with the aim of inspiring others.”, Terms of Reference (ToR) for the assignment, see Annex 1.

2 Men and Masculinities, Promoting Gender Equality in the World of Work, Working Paper 3/2013, Gender, Equality and Diversity Branch, Conditions of Work and Equality Department, ILO.


4 Previously known as the LO-TCO Secretariat of International Trade Union Development Co-Operation.
promoting the development of free, democratic and equal trade union organisations around the world.

Over the three decades that Union to Union has cooperated with trade unions in so-called developing countries, the gender perspective has been promoted as a key issue for many of the joint initiatives. Gender equality is strongly promoted by LO, TCO and Saco in their national work in Sweden, and they all have gender policies and a strong commitment to gender equality within their unions, in the labour market and in society. The international Trade Union movement has, through the Decent Work Agenda, adopted many relevant goals on gender equality, gender policies and strategies to increase women’s influence within the trade unions and at the workplace.

The mainstreaming of gender perspectives is also a condition for all of Sida’s development cooperation. As a partner to Sida, Union to Union has supported projects with training of female union leaders, women’s networks and the development of gender sensitive statistics and gender analysis.

In 2014, as a follow-up of a gender evaluation conducted in 2004, Union to Union decided to also engage in a ‘male change strategy’, promoting men as agents of change for gender equality parallel to its support for female affiliates and their strive for gender equality. This study is part of this strategy, and aims to illustrate how men within the trade union movement are supporting gender equality.

**Method**

The report is mainly based on interviews with union leaders and staff members and a desk review of programme documents from Union to Union, training material, reports, gender policies and guidelines, articles on trade unions and gender, etc.\(^5\)

With an initial list of gender officers and international programme officers at Swedish and global unions which was provided by Union to Union, the data has been collected using “snowball methodology”, where each respondent is asked to suggest documents for further studies and relevant people to interview on the subject. The choice of methodology means that the desk review has been undertaken parallel to the interviews. The method has allowed the study to deepen and validate findings provided during the first interviews.

The study started with interviews with key persons (both women and men) who hold positions related to gender equality work and/or are coordinating international projects within their national or global union. They provided names of colleagues with similar positions at regional and national levels and linked the consultants to men who had participated in gender projects/trainings. These male unionists were assessed by the respondents as promoters of women’s rights in their unions.

Though some Swedish experiences have been studied, focus has been on locating examples from countries where Union to Union and the members of LO, TCO and Saco cooperate with global, national or local unions, supporting initiatives that include gender equality issues.

To broaden the scope of the study, an extensive internet search for relevant information was conducted. Organisations and actors working on masculinities in other contexts than within trade unions were also contacted at an early stage. However, the result of these searches has been weak. In dialogue with Union to Union, it was decided that the study should also include some in-depth interviews with male feminist activists with experience from other social movements and a brief

---

\(^5\) See annex 2 for consulted documents.
desk review of documents related to initiatives that target issues of gender and masculinities. This additional part of the study was included with the purpose of inspiring future gender equality work within the trade union movement.

22 interviews have been conducted with respondents in Europe (including Sweden), Africa, Asia, the Middle East and Latin America. The new identified persons were addressed directly through emails with a request for an interview and some background information. Once the interviews with international respondents were completed, some of the Swedish examples were also studied in greater detail.

Interviews were held over the phone and on Skype with those persons who were willing and able to participate in the study. The desk review and the interviews were conducted during the period December 2015 to March 2016.

Limitations

The snowballing method used, in which already identified respondents are used to locate further information, entails a certain dependency on the first respondents and their organisations. Their examples guide the direction of the study, and examples from other trade unions will necessarily be overlooked. By talking to multiple people who are active in the same project, branch or union, the importance of that project or process will also be reconfirmed, and mainly local and national unions working with global counterparts will be recognised for their gender equality work. All respondents have been asked if they know of other initiatives outside their own union (or in other social movements) to somewhat counteract this bias. The internet search conducted was also an attempt to broaden the scope. Very few examples were provided, however, and most of the resources found through the internet search were documents that were also provided by the interviewees.

No external stakeholders have been consulted concerning their views on the gender work of trade unions, but representatives from gender equality/feminist organisations working on challenging hegemonical masculinities were interviewed. The study does not claim to present men’s engagement in union gender equality work in general; it gives a number of immediate examples and identified trends based on already existing relations between Union to Union, LO, TCO and Saco and their sister organisations, allies and networks around the world.

Union to Union had identified some examples that would be interesting to follow up on in different Asian contexts, but as it was not possible to interview the regional secretary of IUF, the consultant lacked the means to further explore those cases.

Many of the planned interviews were delayed due to the respondents’ international travel and Christmas holidays, and thus the process of identifying new informants was significantly slower than anticipated. The proposed method – to first identify a number of union respondents, ask them to participate in a survey and then select a sample of people to be interviewed based on their survey responses – was impossible to realise.

See Annex 3 for consulted persons.
2. Findings

In the start-up meeting with Union to Union, it was stated that few known examples from trade unions’ gender equality work have focused on male champions or specifically targeted men’s engagement in women’s labour rights and gender equality at the workplace. This was confirmed by the internet search for further material and examples, as well as in the interviews. This is a result in itself.

Many of the consulted Global Unions and trade unions in Sweden identify themselves as feminist unions or as unions with a strong gender equality agenda. All consulted global unions, and most of the consulted national unions, have decided on gender quotas for their congresses and other decision-making bodies and structures. The gender equality work focuses on women’s labour rights, women’s representation within the trade union, and most of the referred gender initiatives in the interviews target women affiliates with gender and leadership trainings.

The report does not present any trade union-led initiatives on men and masculinities to promote gender equality. No examples were found of projects addressing risks at work caused by gender stereotypical expectations of men and hazardous behaviour. No stories were shared of male union activists targeting other male members with awareness raising activities as a conscious and active strategy to promote gender equality. However, there were several men who stated that they saw themselves as setting an example as men promoting gender equality, showing other men that they also could/should join the struggle. The women interviewed also highlighted the importance of the increased support from male members, and in particular from union top leaders in Sweden and in Europe. One union leader in Dominican Republic said that being a man and leading the gender work made it easier for him to reach out to other men, since – he argued – men tend to listen more to other men due to hierarchies and patriarchal structures. He had however not developed any specific strategies to reach other men based on this insight, but made use of the opportunities that presented themselves.

The literature review and many of the interviewees stress that trade union culture and structures constitute a barrier for change, and that new forms of organisation and new ways of leadership are necessary. “Trade union leadership culture is often described as masculinised, whereby institutionalised (masculine) values and norms are embedded in structures, in communication, meeting rituals, election traditions and on-going daily work, and on top of that, leadership generally bears a masculine gender mark.”

Given the slow processes towards gender equality and the underrepresentation of women in union leadership positions, the fact that male unionists stand up for gender equality in patriarchal and male-dominated trade unions is an achievement. The report is based on discussions with many men with a strong conviction that unions must advance women’s labour rights and challenge gender discrimination within their own structures. They focus on supporting their female comrades and leaders in their empowerment processes and promote primarily gender trainings for women and mixed groups. Though most of them were positive to the introduction of strategies focusing on male behaviour and masculinities, they had no experience of such work beyond small, gender-divided group discussions during mixed gender trainings.

The following section of this chapter presents findings from the interviews and highlights interesting examples from the reviewed literature.

---

7 Former Secretary of the Gender Secretariat of the Dominican Teachers’ Association (ADP).
8 Gendering and Diversifying Trade Union Leadership, Sue Ledwith and Lise Lotte Hansen, Routledge 2013.
Empowerment of women is key

Most of the contacted unions have implemented a general gender mainstreaming approach and initiatives focusing on women’s empowerment and leadership. Most male union leaders and men with coordinating functions (for capacity building, specific gender and/or international projects, etc.) have become engaged in gender equality actions and processes as a result of gender work initiated and led by women. At an overall level, all respondents claimed that the advancements of gender issues and women’s leadership would not have been realised without women organising themselves for their rights. Some of the interviewed men actually said that all progress made towards gender equality in their branch, in their union or advancement at specific workplaces was the result of women’s struggle. These respondents claimed that women’s empowerment and ability to claim their rights was what forced men to accept – or in the best case scenario – support gender equality work.

Most consulted persons highlighted the importance of external cooperation. They claimed that this had pushed their leaders and their unions to embrace gender policies and to work more actively with gender issues. The presence of women in leading positions at the international level has also served as an inspiration to both women and men in unions that have had few women as union leaders. The international cooperation has created gender initiatives and spaces, including gender-coordinating functions. It has inspired and fostered new ways of developing the unions, broadened the member base and led to the recognition of so called “women issues” becoming general labour issues. Some respondents at the national level said that international cooperation contributed to the fact that their union had started to address gender in a more comprehensive way.

The policy work or research on gender equality at the global level conducted by global unions and ILO were only cited as drivers of change towards a more gender-aware union in a few interviews. However, the fact that global policies or campaigns were generally not mentioned does not indicate that they have not contributed to the existence of gender equality agendas in the consulted unions.

As a result of women’s empowerment initiatives and focus on women’s union leadership, gender equality is mainstreamed in policy documents. Since the 1990s and onwards, union congresses have been in favour of quotas and other affirmative actions. The policy is often a stated goal of 40% female representatives at different levels of decision-making bodies and arenas, including representation at congresses. Among the unions with a policy goal of 40% are unions with a qualified majority of male affiliates, such as for example IndustriALL, which much be seen as a strong commitment to gender equality.

The interviewees highlighted the importance of policy decisions to regulate minimum quotas for women’s participation in decision-making bodies and processes. This has led to increased participation at congresses and in union committees at global, national and local levels. They all agreed that this had been decisive in promoting women’s participation and leadership. According to almost all respondents, the fact that union leaders in the consulted unions have complied with the gender policies has had a significant impact on the number of women affiliates and the number of women holding key positions within the unions. Many unions struggle with patriarchal and hierarchal structures, which means that men generally hold leadership positions.\(^9\) This is also

---

\(^9\) A survey conducted by the European Trade Union Confederation (ETUC) on data for 2015 showed that only 14.5% (8 out of 55) of the top positions (secretary generals and presidents) in the central trade unions (in 39 European countries) were held by women. Out of 92 vice presidents in these European trade unions, 17 were women. ETUC says that the situation has deteriorated over the last five years. Source: ¿Por qué los sindicatos son tan machistas?, Silvia Cruz, El Español, 5 March 2016.
common in unions that represent women-dominated branches and sectors. The actual number of women leading the unions still might not be high, but adoption of the policies was said to have a symbolic and transformative impact.

Gender equality initiatives within trade unions continue to focus on raising women workers’ awareness of their rights and to contribute to the empowerment of female members. Most consulted documents report on initiatives that only target women, mainly by building the capacities of female union members, or with the aim to attract more women to join the union. Most of the identified initiatives that address specific labour rights for women or abuses against women workers target female affiliates. The respondents strongly supported a continued, but not exclusive, focus on women. This was based on the importance they gave to empowerment processes of women as a means for women to gain influence and rights and to increase gender awareness among men.

The data collection shows that gender initiatives have increased the number of female affiliates in unions that had few female members in the past and that women’s qualitative participation – including women in leadership positions – has been strengthened. Many leaders and members recognise this as an important contribution to the development of trade unions. The African respondents gave several examples in the interviews. This is already known by Union to Union; supported unions have reported on the increased number of female affiliates and the impact this has had on attitudes towards women’s participation in unions and women’s labour rights in different African regions.

The interviews also confirmed that projects focusing on women’s labour rights and role in unions contribute to increased awareness and engagement among men. The International Union of Food, Agricultural, Hotel, Restaurant, Catering, Tobacco and Allied Workers’ Associations’ (IUF) Regional Women’s Project has resulted in a number of male advocates for gender equality. The project has worked with sex-divided group discussions, including efforts to change male unionists’ mind sets. The regional coordinator based in Ghana shared examples on how gender has been discussed from a personal perspective during gender trainings. This approach seemed to have been successful in promoting a personal commitment among both women and men participating in the project. The consulted male unionist participants in this project demonstrated a strong commitment to gender equality. As will be discussed below, they focused primarily on support for female affiliates and female union leaders, and not on men and male behaviour.

Labour rights in focus

According to most respondents, making gender equality a labour rights issue was the best way forward; they referred to and used experiences from class-biased power relations and intersections with other forms of discrimination in society. This has been an effective method in for example South Africa, where one respondent said that references to racial discrimination and the apartheid system made more men receptive to discussions on gendered power relations and discrimination. Discussing the fact that some workers who happen to be women have worse working conditions and are more exposed to abuse at the workplace keeps the focus on the union’s core issues. Making gender equality always a labour rights issue – and not a side issue that mainly concerns women – is thus important.

Some of the interviewees feel that both women and men might be reached more effectively if gender were addressed as a mainstreamed issue or a specific component in union/labour rights

---

10 Unions in countries and sub-regions that had participated in IUF Africa Regional Women’s Project.
trainings, rather than in specific gender trainings. This approach means that more men, as well as women, are reached with gender equality messages. Gender issues become labour rights issues and not a separate concern of women unionists, and the different forms of gender discrimination become common knowledge. As an example, the IUF Action Program for Equality\textsuperscript{11} stresses that IUF and its affiliates should use the IUF gender equality manual in leadership courses for both men and women trade unionists.

The respondent from the Industrial and Commercial Workers’ Union in Ghana also said that mixed workshops were a good practice, in that they offered an opportunity for men to listen to women’s stories and to gather more knowledge about different forms of discrimination against women at the workplace. Another respondent in Colombia representing Sintracarbón (IndustriALL) said that gender equality needed to be discussed in mixed groups, claiming that the debate between women and men unionists is important for challenging norms and learning from experiences of gender discrimination. Direct contact and the issue of identification seem to be important for engagement. The interviewed educators stressed the importance of using active methods, inviting participants to make personal reflections on gender discrimination and stereotypical behaviour.

The strategy of addressing both men and women in gender trainings was also recommended in a recent evaluation of the Network of Women Educators in Latin America\textsuperscript{12}. The evaluation recommends experience sharing with El Salvador\textsuperscript{13} and Colombia, where some gender initiatives targeting men already exist. Men have also been invited to regional meetings of the network, as in the case of Argentina and Brazil.

Though women’s committees and women’s secretariats play an important role in creating spaces where women can share experiences and develop strategies, these segregated spaces are frequently outside of the real decision-making processes. They often have a hard time challenging the traditional structures within unions. In Latin America, some unions are discussing the need to abandon this strategy and to embrace a more norm critical, gender aware and inclusive approach.

\textbf{Using formal structures and the role of male union leaders}

The respondents and the literature stress the importance of support at policy and management levels. Policy decisions in favour of gender equality at union congresses – such as, for example, the application of gender quotas among representatives – are considered crucial for the promotion of gender equality work. Most interviewees agreed that the role of union leaders – who are men in most of the referred cases – is important. The top leaders’ articulation in favour of gender equality plays a key role, and by complying with decisions made at conferences, congresses and in cooperation agreements, they promote the gender agenda. However, most of the consulted persons actually did not view these top leaders as champions, but rather felt that women’s organisations and demands no longer leave room for leaders who do not promote gender equality. One respondent who represented teacher’s unions said that there was a “wave of union leaders competing to be the strongest promoter of gender equality” in Eastern and Southern Africa. She said that even if this was occurring more on a discourse level, it was a sign of a shift. To not be in favour of gender equality is

\textsuperscript{11} Organize, Fight and Win, IUF Action Program for Equality, Geneva, 12-13 May 2012.


\textsuperscript{13} The gender training of men in El Salvador in the teacher’s union ANDS 21 de Junio has, according to the evaluation, contributed to increased gender awareness among men, as well as a higher appreciation of the work carried out by the gender secretariat and in support to women to take part in negotiations. The gender training is also said to have contributed to the development of inclusive and non-sexist pedagogy.
perceived as old fashioned leadership. One male union leader in Latin America said that negative reactions to gender policies are no longer revealed in the open discourse; everyone is officially in favour of gender equality. Critical attitudes are only expressed in closed male circles.

The Public Services International (PSI) regional coordinator in the Middle East did not feel that union leaders in the region in general were champions, but that they had been pushed to accept a gender equality agenda. There were however some exceptions, he said, citing examples from Egypt, Algeria and Lebanon. He also said that there was a backlash along with the stronger position of women in the unions. He noted more negative attitudes among male leaders in some unions. The experience of backlash shows the importance of developing strategies to support agents of change and of building a critical mass of persons in favour of the changes.

Other respondents gave examples of male union leaders who promote gender equality in an active and committed way, and stated that these leaders could actually be seen as gender equality champions. In the cases of Swedish trade unions and the IUF, male presidents have repeatedly pronounced their support and taken action for gender equality. This has had a breakthrough impact on the work carried out by gender coordinators, officers and policy advisors. As already stated, it has also been important for the increase in female representatives at union congresses, in leadership and in other key positions. The active support from male union leaders is also instrumental when female negotiators are not respected by their employer, as demonstrated in one case in India to which IUF referred.

The high policy compliance among union leaders, shop stewards and union staff is worth noting. In other social movements, the existence of gender policies has not always impacted the actions and the practice of the leaders. The respondents concur that union leaders and staff normally follow policy decisions and instructions and that they promote gender equality in their daily work since this has been decided by their congress (or in other decision-making bodies). The experience drawn from for example teachers’ unions in Latin America is that these persons play an important role, although they are perhaps not driven by a personal conviction.

The study Putting Union Gender Equality Policy into Practice in South Africa: The Role of Transformational Leadership includes interesting discussions on a transformed male union leadership. The study is partly based on interviews with union activists who had been involved in processes led by the organisation Gender at Work. Their Gender Action Learning Programme combines “feminist thinking and practice with insights from organizational development to build internal cultures of equality and contribute to the transformation of cultural norms that support achieving gender equality and social justice.”

“The men interviewed uniformly expressed an appreciation of how, by challenging male stereotyped behaviours and aspects of patriarchal power relations, they have enriched their private and public

---

14 The Transformation of Work: Challenges and Strategies, Putting Union Gender Equality Policy into Practice in South Africa: The Role of Transformational Leadership, Solidarity Center.
15 Gender at Work and the South African Labour Research Service partnered with four unions that sought, through the South African Gender Action Learning Program, an alternative to the limited, traditional gender mainstreaming approach. “The Gender at Work approach promotes women’s empowerment and gender equality through addressing institutional norms and rules (stated and implicit) that maintain women’s unequal position in societies. These institutional rules determine who gets what, what counts, who does what and who decides. They include values that maintain the gendered division of labor, prohibitions on women owning land, restrictions on women’s mobility and perhaps most fundamentally, the devaluing of reproductive work. Institutional rules are lived out through organizations which are the social structures that exist in any society.” Bringing Back the Heart: The Gender at Work Action Learning Process with Four South African Trade Unions, The Transformation of Work: Challenges and Strategies Solidarity Center, 2013.
relationships and strengthened their commitment to gender equality.” The report shows that the men who have been involved in these processes start to change not only at work, but also in their homes and private lives, thus forcing them to reflect on their own stereotypical thinking, which in turn has alienated some of them from other men not taking part in these processes.

Policy compliance without personal conviction might be instrumental, as many respondents stressed, but the question is how transformative it is. The examples from South Africa, Sweden and the regional European level suggest that real change happens when the union leaders also embrace a feminist and/or a norm-critical approach.

Reaching out to men

In most cases, the male respondents who were working on gender issues had participated in gender trainings and/or in specific projects targeting women’s labour rights. None of the respondents had been part of gender equality initiatives focusing only on male members or on men and masculinities. Only a few of the respondents had heard of such initiatives and none of the respondents could direct the consultant to projects or actions that exclusively targeted male affiliates as a method of promoting gender equality.

Three examples of union gender trainings (for both women and men) that included discussions on masculinities were found through the interviews and the extended search. They were all examples from teachers’ unions in Latin America. There were also some examples of using male-dominated arenas as platforms for gender discussions, as in the case of Pakistan, where gender trainings and discussions took place in spaces where only male affiliates were present. The example from Pakistan also showed the importance of a long-term perspective on how to change gender perceptions. The respondent there reported that the process of sensitising male unionists took ten years before major changes in women’s participation could be noted. The work involved not only male union members, but also parents and families, in order to facilitate women’s participation in union activities. First, the men accepted discussing women’s rights as part of the union agenda, and after that women were allowed to join the meetings. Women were also trained in basic union work, and mothers came to the meetings to see what their daughters were engaged in. Examples from similar contexts were also used, showing that it was possible to work side by side in the union in Muslim countries like Bangladesh, Malaysia and Indonesia.

The respondent shared a success story from Pakistan, where the Coca Cola Union in the country – where only twenty women are employed, compared to 2000 men – took up the fight for the right to paid maternity leave. The male-dominated union managed to reach a 16-week leave agreement, which is one month more than what the law stipulates. This is another illustration of how gender equality can be promoted despite a minority of female affiliates in the union.

In Sweden, Byggnads’ campaign in 2015, Everyone benefits from a gender equal construction sector, is an example of an effort to focus on stereotypes and challenge masculinity norms within the union and the sector. The campaign targeted both the public and members of the union in an effort to promote discussion of gender stereotypical attitudes and behaviours, but also to attract

---

17 Putting Union Gender Equality Policy into Practice in South Africa: The Role of Transformational Leadership, The Transformation of Work: Challenges and Strategies, Solidarity Center.
18 El Salvador, example mentioned by Lärarförbundet; Colombia, example provided by a gender expert on masculinities in Colombia, where he had provided the lecture; and the Dominican Republic, example provided by the former secretary for the Teacher’s Associations’ gender secretariat.
19 Trade union for construction workers.
women to the sector. Parallel to the official campaign, male members debated the issue in local media. In their article, a group of thirteen male union activists stressed that masculinity norms increased risky behaviour among the workers and that a “macho” culture promotes informal and hidden structures for decision-making, which in turn increases the risk for fraud and corruption in construction projects. Their article was a response to negative responses to the campaign in social media. This is an illustration of how central initiatives can support local activist male champions and vice versa. As a follow-up to the campaign, regional focal points received gender trainings from the organisation Men for Gender Equality Sweden (Män för Jämställdhet).

Trainings targeting young female members of IF Metall in Gothenburg also eventually resulted in groups with only young male affiliates. The union works in a male-dominated sector, and the initiative to reach out to female members with basic union trainings was a strategy to empower these members to be more active within the union. Gender equality was used as a red thread throughout the training. This initiative also spurred interest among young men, and men-only groups were formed, discussing gender issues and labour rights based on the methods used in the groups with women members.

The trainer collected relevant material from media and sex-divided statistics on gender-based differences in work hours, salaries, etc., and this data was used in the discussions. The material for trainings with women was also updated as a result. One of the effects was a very nuanced discussion on gender equality, masculinity and femininity among the men during the training. They opened up and showed another side of themselves, not making insinuating jokes or exhibiting negative attitudes towards women and the issue of gender equality. They allowed themselves to reflect on their own behaviour and the male role in a gender unequal society.

The interviews also point out the relevance of longer gender trainings as a strategy to deepen efforts to promote better working conditions for women in particular, but also for men. The examples concern both specific gender courses (one or more semesters), basic trade union trainings with integrated gender perspective, and cooperation with universities (Latin America) for diploma courses, or folk high schools, folkhögskolor, as in the case of Sweden.

So far, men have been reached mainly through general and inclusive gender trainings and gender discussions a) as participants in specific gender projects that welcome both women and men, b) in basic/introduction courses on labour rights and other union trainings that are mainstreamed with a gender perspective, and where both men and women take part, and c) as participants at congresses and conferences where gender equality is discussed, and d) as part of their formal responsibilities as union leaders.

The desk review provided some examples of gender trainings and material targeting men. The “Training Manual for Partnering with Men to Address Gender Based Violence in the Workplace” developed in India in 2005, outlines how to run a workshop over three days. ILO’s working paper on Men and Masculinities summarises the instructions in the following way:

21 http://www.expressen.se/debatt/skadlig-machokultur-i-byggbranschen/
22 It has however not been possible to see that the campaign has led to any major impact on the gender work of Byggnads. One informant claimed that it was a top-driven initiative led by an external PR agency.
23 More examples will be provided from work on masculinities in other sectors.
25 Working paper 13/2013, ILO.
Day 1 introduces the participants to masculinities as a social construct; to the plurality of masculinities that exist, and; to the dynamics of power relations. This is done through two different participatory exercises. The first exercise introduces the concept of power through a role play situation in pairs, where one is powerful, and the other powerless. The participants are thereafter guided to relate this to power relationships in the workplace, and reflect upon where sources of power in the workplace come from; including gender, position, age, caste, education and class. In the second exercise, the participants are requested to share a story or instance from their life when they felt powerless, followed by an instance where they felt they had power over others. The day concludes with reflections around how the experience of power is not absolute, and how people can experience both power and powerlessness in their lives. Lastly, the discussion is also guided towards reflections upon how power and notions of masculinity are related, and how masculinity is not necessarily about the experience of power, but can also be about a sense of entitlement to power.

Day 2 deals with the concepts of equity and equality, gender and gender stereotypes. Understanding of these concepts is translated into a discussion about different forms of violence, and how to identify gender-based violence. The first exercise introduces the concept of equality and equity through storytelling. The stories provide a foundation for the participants to discuss special measures such as affirmative action. In the second exercise participants are asked to associate freely what it means to be a man and what it means to be a woman. The characteristics, as identified by the participants, are afterwards divided into biological and socially perceived traits. These traits are then brought into the world of work, to unpack the gendered stereotypes behind “men’s work” and “women’s work”. The third exercise of Day 2 starts by asking participants to name different types of violence they have seen, heard about or faced. The list is subsequently divided by the trainer into “violence faced by men” and “violence faced by women”. The group is then asked to discuss what differentiates violence faced by men, from that faced by women. The exercise then goes on to focus in on sexual harassment as a form of gender-based violence. Case studies of sexual harassment are presented to the groups, and in the ensuing discussion, the groups are asked to discuss the effects of sexual harassment on the working environment and individual. Participants are then asked to come up with a role play about sexual harassment in the workplace. The trainer provides knowledge on different types of sexual harassment and its definitions, demonstrating linkages to power relations covered in Day 1.

Day 3 looks to find solutions to working towards violence-free workplaces and reflects upon what personal and institutional commitments can be made toward this end. Participants are therefore asked to identify ways in which men can contribute towards gender equality, and how to contribute to workplaces free of sexual harassment. Conversely, the participants should also identify what might prevent colleagues from promoting gender equality. Based on the participants’ contributions, the workshop facilitator guides a discussion on personal commitment to change, in relation to participants’ own domestic and work situation.

The former secretary of the Gender Secretariat of ADP, Dominican Teachers’ Union, was appointed through the union’s formal election procedures as the first man to hold that position. Though he had earlier experience from coordinating with the feminist movement, at first he was reluctant to take the position, since he felt it should be held by a woman. In retrospect, he sees that it was strategic to have a man leading the secretariat, showing that gender equality is of concern to both men and women. He stressed through that the success of his work was grounded in a commitment to the feminist movement and emphasised that men need to learn from female activists. Another respondent, who works for IUF in South Africa, also said that men who have the opportunity to learn about gender equality in their roles as project coordinators or educators have a great chance to become male champions.

There were also examples of unions reaching out to men in society in general and to the husbands of women workers. In Zambia, Wangwa Farms has made an effort to plan union activities at times
when female members can attend. The importance of having the women on board and active in the union has been discussed with the husbands of married female affiliates.

Issues that engage both women and men

The examples that were given in the interviews and found in the literature focus mainly on three areas: Sexual harassment at the workplace, gender-based violence and maternity/parental leave and other rights of mothers and fathers at the workplace. The interviews with men working with gender equality also showed that the commitment to gender equality was based in anger about injustices and a strong sense of solidarity. They did not view the engagement in women’s labour rights and gender equality within the trade union movement as very far removed from the overall reasons why they had joined the union. This supports the assertion of other respondents that gender equality should remain at the core of the labour rights discourse.

The struggle for parental leave, including benefits and rights at the workplace, focuses on women as mothers, and seldom on men as fathers and caretakers. In some contexts, however – for example, Sweden – this is a gender issue that engages male members and has the potential to attract interest to a union’s gender work.

Sexual harassment and/or gender-based violence in the work environment (both from employers and male colleagues); and to certain extent other forms of violence and risks connected to male- or female-dominated professions, are perhaps the issues that attract most attention. Many respondents mentioned sexual harassment as an area against which both women and men were engaged. There were examples of the engagement being triggered by gender discrimination that targeted a friend or a relative. That indicates that personal and real stories and identification with the person or the groups being discriminated against might be helpful in engaging both men and women in gender equality work.

One of the former participants in the IUF Regional Women’s Project in Africa explained how he now saw it as his role to inform other men on gender equality in general and about sexual harassment in particular. He stressed that more male unionists need access to gender trainings and he said that for him, the best way to face men’s resistance was to stay focused and use his own knowledge to encourage other men to engage in gender issues.

The power of identification and use of emotions to create engagement was emphasised by all of the consulted educators, and male feminist activists in other social movements also pointed to them as a factor of success. The Swedish Workplace HIV/AIDS Programme (SWHAP), which supports workplace programmes on HIV and wellness in 11 Sub-Saharan African countries, has used forums and industrial theatre to enhance messages in a visual manner and to explain the sexual harassment policy in a way that was memorable for employees. The desk review of material on men’s engagement for gender equality also shows that sexual harassment, gender-based violence, and HIV and AIDS are common themes for initiatives that target men in society, and that personal testimonies are widely used.

One example of how sexual harassment is being targeted is Building and Wood Workers International (BWI) in Malaysia’s zero tolerance sexual harassment policy: 

26 Union to Union shared information that some on-going projects have progressed, going from negotiating maternity leave to parental leave. However, there is however a certain level of caution on behalf of the women, who fear that men will not assume the caretaking responsibilities for the baby and the household during the leave.

not an acceptable behaviour by any BWI staff member at any time. In addition, sexual harassment is not acceptable by any affiliate at any BWI function including congress, statutory meetings and seminars. All members are required to sign the policy. The policy highlights the fact that all persons can be exposed to sexual harassment, including men by other men or by their female bosses. BWI has also developed a document on other risks in occupations where women dominate. The desk review also provided other examples of policies and codes of conduct, such as for instance The Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU). In Sweden, LO’s Gender equality barometer 2015 also took a special look at sexual harassment, emphasising it as a work environment risk that is particularly serious in service occupations. Though the issue is not at all new in the trade union movement, many unions struggle with resistance to placing issues like sexual harassment high on their agenda.

The IUF Occupational Health and Safety Environment initiative (OHSE) to improve the standards on plantations and farms in Africa is also addressing the issue of sexual harassment. The OHSE Safe Farms Booklet mentions sexual harassment both as a rights and security issue and provides the following examples:

**Zambia** Sexual harassment on horticultural farms used to be widespread. Supervisors had the power to hire and fire, and they used this to abuse women workers. NUPAAW took this up with the employers, and now many have a company policy (...). Workers are told to report any abuse to Human Resources Department, and supervisors found guilty are dismissed. Also, HR now does the hiring and firing, not the supervisors, thus removing their power. At the same time, the unions worked with the women’s movement in the country to raise widespread public awareness, and a Gender-Based Violence Act was passed in 2011. There is now a lot of media coverage where there was not before.

**Kenya** KUSPAW has been encouraging men as well as women to sit down and discuss problems and find solutions, rather than resort to violence. It is “a both-sided thing”, says [...] the union’s Education Officer. The union has developed a policy on sexual harassment which it is promoting at all workplaces where it has members. It is also in the process of developing a sexual harassment training manual to be used in its study circle training.

The interview with the OHSE regional coordinator, who had a long background in organising agricultural workers and extensive experience as an educator, stressed the importance of having policies in place since he considered policy compliance to play an important role in promoting women’s rights. This had been the case of sexual harassment policies, but he also mentioned the role that other gender policy decisions had played in the union. According to him, affirmative action had been key in promoting women’s leadership and roles in the union. The fact that women are reporting abuses and claiming their rights, both as members and as union leaders, pushes men to support gender equality but also strengthen the union to become more united.

Sexual harassment is related to other work environment risks. Risk-taking and safety issues are highly gendered, connected to self-perception and societal views on femininities and masculinities. General discussion on hazardous work and gendered risks should be relevant for both women and

---

28 Women at Work, Safety, Health and Environment (SHE), BWI, no date.
30 The National Union of Plantation, Agricultural and Allied Workers.
31 The Kenya Union of Sugar Plantation Agricultural Workers.
men. The interviews gave accessible examples of initiatives to improve work conditions in female-dominated sectors and occupations and focused less on how male-dominated branches could also be targeted from a gender perspective. As the working paper Men and Masculinities from ILO stresses, “men predominate in dangerous industries such as mining and may be more vulnerable to physical and psycho-social risk, from silicosis and tuberculosis to stress and alcoholism”. As will be discussed in chapter 3, this could be an entry point for promoting interest in men and masculinities initiatives.

The trade union movement has a rather broad experience from working on HIV and AIDS related to the workplace. Within this work, reports and training manuals have been developed that address the pandemic from a gendered lens, identifying among other things so called “risky behaviour” and how this is linked to gendered expectations and behaviour. The extensive work includes discussions on sexuality, sexual orientation and gender norms and contains methods that could be recycled for use in gender work without a particular focus on HIV.

The interview with IUF in South Africa also brought up how the work related to health risks could engage both women and men. Information provided by the unions on the use of pesticides and its impact of reproductive health of women and men has opened up for discussions that go beyond gender stereotypical thinking. Reproductive health becomes a rights issue for both women and men and a concern of the union.

The desk review included an article discussing safety and masculinities in the mining sector. The article proposes a programme for gender and safety in the mining sector. It is thus not an example of existing initiatives, but it raises several interesting aspects that could be relevant in similar initiatives. It refers to an earlier research project in Australia “Mining for a Safer Masculinity” and the lessons learned from that project. The research showed that failure to address normative expressions of masculinity had a negative effect on workers’ safety. This issue was also raised by the male affiliates of Byggnads in the cited article.

The additional search on material on male-led initiatives on masculinities and gender equality gave no results on the matter of risk-taking at work among men and in male-dominated professions. This is surprising. The role of the traditional male breadwinner and the consequences of neoliberal and globalised markets targeting female workers rather than male workers are widely discussed. But while feminist activists address the negative consequences for men of the traditional views on masculine behaviour, they seem to overlook that stereotypical attitudes regarding what men should endure at work result in the neglect or denial of men’s security and labour rights.

One of the proposals in the mentioned article is the introduction of Gendered Behaviours Review, which “involves a number of workshops with safety personnel to help them understand why a focus on gender is important for safety, see what their organisation’s existing safety culture looks like through a gender lens, and know what they need to do to improve on areas where a lack of focus on gender is driving at-risk gendered behaviours in the field. As part of the training, safety personnel will conduct reviews of key safety documents, participate in focus groups and conduct interviews with employees. As they undergo this training, they learn not only theoretical knowledge about the organisation’s gendered safety culture but also practical and sustainable skills in how to deploy a gendered approach to safety. [...] Because the process for conducting a Gendered Behaviours

---

32 Men and Masculinities, Working paper 3/2013, ILO.
Review is participatory, it also provides safety personnel with practical skills they can use in their everyday tasks to ensure there is ongoing attention to gender in all aspects of the mine site safety. Another proposal of the authors is a Gendered Behaviours Mentor Program, which invites employees to increase awareness of gendered behaviours in their specific workplace culture and to develop strategies for improving their own experiences of their workplace.

Finally, the interviews also showed the importance of gender/feminist studies as a strategy for deepening the discussions and the gender work within unions. The studies involve both female and male unionists. These sometimes compulsory courses have — in the case of the male participants — helped male shop stewards deepen their understanding and see their own behaviour in the light of women’s relative subordination at work and in the labour market.

Negative trends pushing for new ways
Respondents from Sweden and at global unions mentioned that the increased pressure on flexibility, deteriorated work conditions and unsecure employment, including forced part-time employment, that characterise many branches all over the world today, have led to trade unions being more eager to prioritise these issues than they used to be. These working conditions have long since been common in female-dominated labour markets and professions, and as such they have received less attention by most unions. Through new economic policies and shifts at local and global labour markets, the poor working conditions and abused labour rights that used to affect women more have become general problems for workers, which means that men’s working conditions are also deteriorating.

The interviewees, particularly those working in the Latin American context, also raised the challenges the trade unions are facing in attracting new members. Several of the interviewees mentioned that gender equality should not be seen in isolation, but rather in relation to diverse forms of exclusion and discrimination in the job market. The high unemployment rates among young women and men over the world also mean that young persons are not involved in union work. It is also hard to make contact with and attract young workers in precarious work. Young workers are thus hard to reach, and by opening up for critical discussions on the unions’ role in society, and to new perspectives and alliances, unions have a lot to gain, according to these respondents.

The same patriarchal and hierachal structures that exclude and alienate women also discriminate against young unionists. Some of the respondents said that changing trade unions structures is an issue of survival and necessary to maintain unions’ relevance. Many mentioned alliance building with other social movements and the civil society as a way of strengthening the trade union movement. They felt that unions need to learn from other social movements and how they have adopted their structures to become more horizontal and inclusive. For some parts of the trade union movement, this can include decentralisation and democratisation processes. Respondents from Latin America in particular stressed the need for unions to regain their voice as an actor of change in society at large. This includes a greater openness to different claims and learning from other sectors, such as for instance the indigenous and the environmentalist movements. Respondents in both Africa and

34 “La lucha global por la democracia requiere sindicatos fuertes, capaces de actuar en alianzas con otros grupos y fuerzas democráticas y populares de la sociedad civil. La necesidad de cambio es ineludible. Para ello el movimiento obrero necesita insertarse en la sociedad y buscar alianzas en ella. Necesita desencapsularse para intervenir en otras nuevas (viejas) problemáticas.” Punto 1. Actualidad política, económica y social “En América Latina las certidumbres tienen patas cortas”, Document provided by IUF, Latin America.
Latin America told about their coordination with women’s organisations and other civil society movements to become more relevant as actors, both as trade unions and as actors in society.

Critical thinking about gender norms

The descriptions of trainings and provided gender training materials showed that active methods are preferred. Women and men have been invited to reflect on their attitudes and behaviour through role-play and in-depth discussions, often in sex-divided groups. Respondents in charge of education and trainings stressed that men needed to experience how it is to be discriminated as a woman on the job, and that the use of role-play in men-only groups was one way of producing and embodying those feelings of gender discrimination. The respondent in Lebanon working for PSI in the Middle East region agreed with the interviewed educator in Ghana that men need to listen to women’s stories and to process the knowledge through discussions to achieve a more critical way of thinking about gender norms. That implies working with attitudes, values and feelings. He also suggested that gender work needs to actively address the conflicting interests embedded in the patriarchal structures. Gender equality is not only a matter of education and awareness; it is a matter of reorganising the work of the unions. Structures that exclude need to be challenged, and the way of dealing with power issues needs to be revised. Women need to shake men, he insisted. He did not believe in an approach where men are supposed to be convinced; methods need to be more direct and confrontational, but with peaceful methods, and they need to deal with values.

Examples challenging what is seen as possible and what is “not done in our culture” from other branches, trade unions, or from experiences in neighbouring countries have also been successful approaches in opening up for a more critical discussion among male members. The IUF regional women’s project had successfully used the comparison with trends in the labour market and trade unions in other countries.

The reviewed literature also shows that questioning the male breadwinner model – not seeing it as a source of power, but as a source of stress – is a strategy for engaging men in the gender discussions. As already mentioned, the globalised export-led development paradigm that dominates many developing countries’ market economies, based on female-dominated workplaces in export free trade zones, also challenges the idea of men as the primarily breadwinners.

Parental leave was mentioned earlier as an issue that engages both men and women. Men claiming their right to stay home with their children is norm-breaking in itself, but it also opens up for a broader discussion on men as caregivers. This is an area that has been widely addressed by male feminists and there is extensive literature on the matter, including method resources and guides for trainings. Linking unions’ work on the right to parental leave for both women and men to the experiences of organisations and activists that engage men for gender equality might be strategic, particularly in areas where this struggle has not yet been combined with a questioning of other aspects of traditional male roles.

The assignment has also tried to map experiences from challenging gender norms and sexual orientation. No such initiatives were identified at union level, and LGBTI issues were only mentioned in few interviews, most of them with Swedish unions. The response to direct questions on how the union addressed sexual harassment did not include any reference to harassment of lesbian women, gay men, bisexual, transgender or intersex persons. Union to Union provided some data on actions taken in trade unions in different Asian contexts, but it was not possible to follow-up on this. One respondent mentioned that a teacher’s union in El Salvador has a LGBTI policy. More transgender persons take part in the women’s educators network in Latin America, and LGBTI rights are
discussed as part of the gender equality agenda. Another respondent in South Africa said that the trade union movement had not been very active in discussing LGBTI rights, but that using the employment equity act in trainings and referring to cases of discrimination against LGBTI persons was something he planned to do as an educator. In contexts with high HIV prevalence and where unions have been pushing for increased awareness and rights around HIV and AIDS, sexuality, sexual orientation and gender norms, including LGBTI, have been brought up. As mentioned previously, there are lessons to be learned from these experiences, and the HIV and AIDS materials that highlight LGBTI rights could be adapted to be relevant for other gender initiatives as well.

On a global level, and in the case of Sweden, policy documents were found on LGBTI rights, as well as country specific reports on LGBTI persons and their situations and conditions at the workplace.

**Men engaging for gender equality in other social movements**

The study also included several consultations with men engaged in movements working for gender equality, mainly through challenging male norms and hegemonic masculinities. An internet search among listed resources at menengage.org, a search on the public Colombia-based Facebook group *Por una vida sin machismo*[^35], as well as a general google search, were conducted for relevant handbooks and reports published by other actors than trade unions.

The literature and the interviews confirmed the impression that there are no or very few direct links between feminist approaches to the construction of new masculinities and trade unions’ gender equality work. The additional search produced some examples of trade unions in Sweden and in Colombia that had invited male feminist activists to talk about gender and masculinities. This was generally done as a component of gender capacity building initiatives of boards, shop stewards and/or members.[^36] These initiatives took similar approaches as the above-mentioned union activities, that is, introducing a focus on male affiliates and male behaviour as part of general gender trainings. The interviewed male activists had had very little contact with the trade union movements and could not recall any union leaders present in the Men Engage movement.

On the other hand, the search on menengage.org for material targeting groups produced zero hits on labour rights issues. This is rather surprising. While there is extensive literature on health issues, including HIV and AIDS, and sexual and reproductive health and rights; gender-based violence, LGBTI rights, the caretaking role and parenting, and education and positive discipline, there seems to be no focus on labour rights or the workplace as an arena for the construction and deconstruction of gender roles. One might expect that stereotypical thinking regarding risk taking at work and the expectations of heroic union leaders would be relevant for the Men Engage movement. Work of a hazardous nature combined macho attitudes towards risks at the workplace, as well as the “frontline heroic” union leader, can have fatal consequences.[^37]

The feminist movement of men engaging in gender equality has had interesting experiences working with groups of men who are normally not reached by gender programmes or feminist thinking, such as for example rural workers (who are not affiliated to unions) or young men in popular urban areas. Common for these initiatives are the use of active and participatory methods that invite the participants to start the work from an emotional and corporal perspective rather than from a

[^35]: [https://www.facebook.com/groups/477418668985671/](https://www.facebook.com/groups/477418668985671/)
[^36]: *Byggnads and Män för Jämställdhet* is one example, as well as FECODE, Federación Colombiana de Trabajadores de Educadores.
[^37]: When considering threats and assassinations of human rights defenders, union leaders are among the most exposed actors.
rational, logical and political approach. By using feelings, identification and role-plays and talking about intimate, personal matters, the issue of gender equality becomes personal. One respondent said that “deactivating the word” is key to opening up for different views on masculinities and allowing the participants to lower their defences. By avoiding the political discourse, not paying so much attention to what is being said, but instead concentrating on what we actually do, the groups discuss the possibility of new practices in actions and in how we express ourselves. The male activists believed in using sex-divided groups to deepen the discussions and to allow real reflection. This was not seen as an end, but rather as a means to create safe spaces and allow participants – in this case men – to have in-depth discussions on how masculinity norms influence their lives.

Using some of the norm-critical material used for gender equality and human rights work in other social movements might be relevant. A Swedish respondent thought that these materials could also be further developed through a closer and direct cooperation with trade unions interested in developing their gender work to also include perspectives on masculinities.

3. Conclusions

The task for this assignment was to find examples of trade unions working with male affiliates to promote gender equality and to identify factors that drive male gender champions within the trade union movement. The findings suggest that this is still very much pioneer work and that few unions have focused on men or masculinities in their gender equality strategies. There is however a growing number of male unionists with a strong commitment to gender equality. A critical mass of both female and male gender equality champions might be able to transform their unions to become more norm-critical, promoting new forms of gender aware leadership, pushing for more inclusive and gender equal agendas.

All interviewed persons at global, regional and national levels spoke about the progress of women’s leadership within unions, the increase in female members and how women’s labour rights are higher up on the agenda than they were 10 or 20 years ago. A common feature for the consulted trade unions is that they identify themselves as feminist unions or as unions with a strong gender equality agenda. Most have decided on gender quotas for their congresses and other decision-making bodies and structures.

The chapter on findings did not report on the many examples of women’s empowerment and struggles that were provided in the interviews, since the focus of this assignment has been on men’s roles in those processes of change. However, it must be stated that the accounted progress of gender equality is foremost the result of organised women and women’s demands for their rights at the workplace and within the unions.

There are, as the male respondents showed, many men who support the work initiated by women. Male union leaders and male unionists working with education, gender mainstreamed projects or women’s rights initiatives play an important role in promoting gender equality in their unions. The interviewees claimed that this commitment is sometimes based on the men’s own conviction and what they have learned from female union activists. In other cases, their support for gender equality work is a result of complying with union policies, congress and management decisions or cooperation agreements with international partners. The fact that it is impossible to neglect gender equality as a topic for union leaders in the consulted unions must be seen as a victory.

38 For example, the Masculinity Manual of Diakonia, or the material used in Machofabriken (The Macho Factory), Män för Jämställdhet.
The findings indicate however that real transformative change happens when the union leaders also embrace a feminist and/or a norm-critical approach, and when unionist leaders and members have the opportunity to dedicate sufficient time to in-depth gender studies. Unions that have engaged in long-term processes of change that challenge traditional gender norms and behaviour have also achieved better working conditions for both women and men.

Most respondents said that they were positive to trying the strategy of working in a more focused way with male members. They also stressed the importance of not making gender equality a special issue, but aligning the gender equality discussions with the overall struggle for equality for workers. The strive for gender equality should, as in the case of challenging other structural forms of discriminations, be part of the general union agenda.

There is strong support for the continuation of empowering women workers and building capacities of women unionists to organise themselves, to claim their rights and to take up leadership positions. The strategy has not only resulted in empowered women unionists, but also in increased gender awareness among men. Without strong organisation among women workers, the focus on men as champions for gender equality will not be successful. This does not necessary imply that unions need to have special women committees, or women-only networks; on the contrary, this has repeatedly proved to be a counterproductive method through which women have been sidestepped and excluded from the most important and strategic decision-making structures and processes. It does however imply that there is a need for spaces where feminist union activists and women affiliates can discuss and develop their empowerment strategies. Feminist union leaders, women or men, continue to be vital for striving towards gender equality in the labour market. The experience so far is that these leaders have been fostered in unions with strong and well-organised female union activists.

The findings also support a more intersectional approach in the gender equality strategies. Age was raised as a particularly important factor, but sector, branch and occupational differences should also influence how gender is discussed. Additionally, an intersectional approach to gender would support a stronger focus on different power relations and open up for a more norm-critical way of thinking. That would benefit affiliates that live with disabilities, LGBTI members, or those who belong to other discriminated groups in society, as for examples indigenous or racialised workers.

The men and masculinities approach is not common among the consulted unions. But the idea of engaging men in gender equality work through targeted actions that focus on how gender stereotypes also negatively impact male workers is not new in the trade union movement. The ILO 2009 resolution on Gender Equality at the heart of decent work states that “Regarding knowledge and capacity building to support gender-sensitive policy formulation the ILO should: Collect information on pressures placed on boys and men to conform to gender stereotypes in the world of work”. It would be relevant to explore the literature on unsafe working conditions and risks and how that could engage both women and men in challenging gender norms related to different branches and occupations.

The literature also suggests that another valuable entry point would be to focus on how leadership and traditional decision-making structures within the unions are constructed along traditional masculinity models. While much of the current gender equality work focuses on leadership and formal structures, a more comprehensive approach to men’s (and women’s) traditional behaviour within the union, at the workplace and in society at large could potentially allow a deeper discussion on the power relations that inhibit increased gender equality. The traditional view of union leaders corroborates with a patriarchal society, placing the male worker with a given power position within a
male-dominated hierarchal system. Challenging this view could open up for new forms of organising and new ways of leadership within the trade union movement.

Many of the respondents highlighted the role that external cooperation has played in pushing new methods and ideas forward. It is thus possible to continue to challenge the more conventional gender equality agenda and the gender mainstreaming approach and test new and more innovative methods. The founders of Union to Union and the global unions and their national members should thus feel free to discuss how the focus on empowerment of women affiliates can be combined with initiatives targeting men and masculinities. The findings suggest that using other norm-critical experiences from for example the HIV workplace initiatives, or the lessons learned from the Men Engage movement, reaching out to men who have not been reached by other gender programmes, could be a productive approach.

The study also shows examples of negative trends where the experience of backlash manifests itself in new forms of resistance to gender policies. There seems to be a risk for women union leaders being replaced by men when the novelty of gender polices no longer attracts attention. This highlights the importance of developing support networks to agents of gender change and of building a critical mass of persons in favour of these changes. Norm-challenging work is dependent on support mechanisms for its sustainability.
4. Recommendations

1. When developing and introducing new gender strategies and methods, make sure that these are backed by a formal decision at a high level within the unions. The policy compliance among union leaders is a strength and should be used to achieve implementation of gender strategies.

2. Support initiatives that develop gender training modules that can be held as part of other labour rights trainings. The modules should include real examples of gender discrimination from branches and work environments relevant to the participants and be used in exercises where women and men separately and jointly discuss strategies for change.

3. Use active methods and real case studies in union trainings and related activities to raise awareness and promote engagement among both women and men.

4. Support in-depth gender and feminist studies as a strategy to deepen the discussions and gender work within unions. Allow long-term processes to ensure that men male and women female in the unions are equipped with sufficient knowledge to build norm-critical and sustainable changes that favour gender equality.

5. Support male champions, or men in central functions, to connect and build alliances with gender and women’s rights activists both within trade unions and other social movements. The development of norm-changing strategies needs to be fostered in a feminist environment.

6. Support networking and experience sharing between the pilot initiatives on men and masculinities that exist in different unions, and between these initiatives and the work of male gender equality activists in other movements.

7. Link unions’ work on the right to parental leave for both women and men to the experiences of organisations and activists that engage men for gender equality. This is particularly relevant where this struggle has not yet been combined with a questioning of other aspects of traditional male roles.

8. Explore the possibility of promoting gender projects that focus on work environment issues and risks at the workplace by looking into how masculinity and femininity norms increase the risk of accidents and abuse. Develop these initiatives from lessons learned and experiences already made from projects that focus on sexual harassment.

9. Make use of the transformative nature of gender equality work to also include alliance building with other social movements, visualising the role the trade union movement can play as a promoter of gender equality in society at large.
Annex 1 – Terms of Reference

Terms of Reference

Gender study with positive masculine examples/champions of gender equality work

Background

Union to Union is a co-operation body founded by the Swedish Trade Union Confederation (LO), the Swedish Confederation of Professional Employees (TCO) and the Swedish Confederation of Professional Associations (Saco) for international trade union development cooperation funded by the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Sida. Union to Union, previously known as the LO-TCO Secretariat of International Trade Union Development Co-Operation, conducts its work via LO, TCO and Saco together with their affiliated members, often in collaboration with the International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC) or the Global Union Federations (hereinafter referred to as GUFs). Union to Union’s statutes, aim at promoting the development of free, democratic and equal trade union organisations around the world.

Union to Union has existed for more than thirty years, and during this time the international trade union co-operation has developed and integrated various analytical perspectives and practical tools in its work to enhance the positive impact and results for the target groups in the projects. Training and capacity building is used by the majority of the organisations in order to reach their planned goals, mainly concerning their core activities (organising, educating, negotiating and influencing) and by way of externally financed projects.

Union to Union is one of Sida’s framework agreement organisations. This means that Union to Union has a long-term framework agreement with Sida. This agreement requires that Union to Union fulfils certain criteria in its development co-operation work and also acknowledge other relevant criteria for Swedish foreign policy.

A key criteria is the fact that Swedish development cooperation must include gender equality in all its actions. Union to Union has during the years supported many projects with training of female leaders and networks and supported gender sensitive statistics and gender analysis. In 2014, the task of following up the gender evaluation conducted in 2004 was initiated with the objective to target the perspective of a male-change-strategy for gender equality. Male-change-strategy refers to men as agents of change, or as it is expressed in the Swedish book “Den feministiska utmaningen mot en jämställd arbetsmarknad” on page 115: “In a democratic organization, it is the privileged and norm-bearing person that need to make proof of, and that bear greater responsibility for, Inclusion”.

Sida as a governmental institution has during many years supported gender equality civil society organisations working with men as actors. Since the Trade Union movement internationally, through the Decent work agenda also has adopted many relevant goals on gender equality, Union to Union considers it of interest to find good examples on masculine behavioural changes, in the direction of gender equality, within the movement and in its actions/ programs and/or projects. The study would with this orientation enable more actions to be taken in this direction, since it is easier for trade union movement to be inspired by examples from the same movement than from other organisations in the sector of civil society.

Purpose of the Study

The study should give input to a “different methodology” to achieve gender equality, mainly through male champions for gender equality (when men change their gender behavior with the aim of inspire others) and strategic work. To find examples of unions which have been working on changing male behaviour/role as a strategy to promote gender equality within the unions, among unions affiliates, at workplaces, or in society in general.
When we say “different methodology”, it’s defined in relation to the most common way of working, as seen in the project portfolio to, support gender equality, which is supporting women’s participation in all activities and shop steward position/organizational position, lifting women in leadership trainings and supporting female networks. We primarily look for good examples that are relevant in our countries of co-operation.

Referent examples
1. Work of BWI in Malaysia on anti-sexual harassment within the organisation. With a brochure that is mandatory for signing, they prohibit sexual harassment for any assignment in the trade union.

2. The IUF African regional project to promote women’s participation in their unions, has indicated side-effects on parental leave (recognizing the father, ie not only focusing on *maternal* leave) and the way trade unions cooperate.

3. Trade Union Congress of the ITUC has recently acknowledged the need of solidarity with the LBGT persons at workplaces and communities. Through a charter, taken in February 2015 they will heighten their effort on LBGT-issues; https://www.tuc.org.uk/sites/default/files/LBGTITUCcharter.pdf which will probably change norms in Trade Unions.

Questions that can guide the study
- What examples can we find of “male champions for gender equality” (when men change their gender behavior with the aim of inspire others) within the trade union movement especially in our partner countries but also globally
- How have they come about and are there contextual implications that are important to consider?
- Have the examples/initiatives/methods been spread and reached (/incorporated?) the strategic level of the trade union work, and if not - what are the counterforces or impediments?
- What can other trade unions learn from these examples and how can Union to Union help to spread best practices/tools/methods.

Stakeholders to be interviewed
- Partners with great examples
- Union to Union programs department
- GUF representatives including gender officers/experts and regional GUF representatives
- Swedish Confederations
- Swedish affiliates
- Local affiliates

Methodology
- The study is thought to be a desk study, but if visits of any specific project will be necessary this could be added on afterwards with additional funding. Union to Union will provide a list with the names of those subject to interviews but are also interested in creative suggestions from the consultant.
- Further to this, the consultants shall provide a draft methodology section in the offer to the assignment.

Specification of requirements
The evaluation team shall:
- have considerable and documented experience from work with studies and “analysing methodologies”
- have experience of development analysis
- have experience from trade union development co-operation
- have excellent knowledge in English (oral and written)
- state the total cost of the assignment, specified in the form of the hourly fee, reimbursable costs, and any other costs (all costs shall be given in Swedish kronor, including VAT)
- propose a work plan with methodology and time schedule for the assignment (including the inception report).

The assignment
- The evaluation will be carried out during 2015 but a final date for the report can be postponed until spring 2016.
- The work shall result in a report with analytical background, conclusions and not more than 10 practical and strategic recommendations that are prioritised in order of importance.
- The evaluators are responsible for a presentation of the report at the head office of Union to Union.
- A draft report shall be submitted in electronic form to Union to Union no later than February 1st 2015.
- A final report shall be finished no later than March 1st 2016.
- The report shall be written in English and not exceed a maximum of 25 pages excluding appendices.
- The final report must be proof read and presented in a way that enables publication without further editing.
- Cost: limited to SEK 150,000 incl VAT

Tender and Contact Person
The tender shall be sent in no later than October 12th 2015 to evaluations@uniontounion.org. Sigrid Bergfeldt can answer questions on the terms of reference: sigrid.bergfeldt@uniontounion.org, 072-533 27 68
Annex 2 – Consulted documents

**Union to Union**

- Anslagsframställan 2014 – 2016, LO-TCO Biståndsnämnd, till Sida Civsam (no date)
- Practical Advice for Gender Analysis/Praktiska råd till jämställdhetsanalys, LO-TCO Biståndsnämnd, (no date)
- Bilaga 3: Decent Work — Decent Life, programmet per sektor, LO-TCO Biståndsnämnd, sektorredovisning till Sida Civsam (no date)
- Redovisning 2010-2012, Strategiområdet Ökad jämställdhet och minskad diskriminering, Verksamhetsberättelse 2010-2012, LO-TCO Biståndsnämnd
- 2.6 Ökad jämställdhet och minskad diskriminering, Verksamhetsberättelse 2013, LO-TCO Biståndsnämnd
- *Facklig postinspektör anmälde chef för sextrakasserier mot kvinnlig kollega, åtalades för förtal*, Jocke Nyberg (no date, no reference where the article was published)

**Other documents**

- Action Programme on achieving gender equality in trade unions, Gender Equality, ITUC International Trade Union Confederation, November 2007
- Construir la igualdad en solidaridad, Por Rafael Feliz, Revista de la Red de Trabajadoras de la Educación de la Internacional de la Educación para America Latina, 2014
- From Lusaka to Accra, More women, doing more, building our unions, Achievements of the IUF Africa Regional Women’s Project, 2007-2011, IUF, IUTA, IUL
- Genders at Work: Exploring the role of workplace equality in preventing men’s violence against women, Scott Holmes and Michael Flood, White Ribbon Australia
- Gendering and Diversifying Trade Union Leadership redigerad av Sue Ledwith,Lise Lotte Hansen, Routledge 2013, google source used: https://books.google.gm/books?id=cnTHp3eSLFcC&pg=PA7&lpg=PA7&dq=union+masculinities&sourc e=bl&ots=9tS41HTut1&sig=n_rvU2OJCpPB2yQnLwfrEaYOSE&hl=sv&sa=X&ved=0ahUKEwia7qrwt6nKAhULXBQKVzgAJoQ6AEIOTAE#v=onepage&q=union%20masculinities&f=false
- ICU-Ghana seeks dignity for Hotel Workers, ICU Body Mapping, one pager without date
Krokodiler och machomän, En studie om maskuliniteter och ett yrkesliv under förändring, Fanny Högrell, Examensarbete för kandidatexamen i Globala studier, Institutionen för Globala studier, Göteborgs Universitet, 2014

Masculinities, Promoting Gender Equality in the World of Work, Working Paper 3/2013, Gender, Equality and Diversity Branch, Conditions of Work and Equality Department, ILO

Nu ska machokulturen i byggbranschen bekämpas, Byggvärlden, 11 Maj 2015,  
http://www.byggvarlden.se/utmanar-machokultur-86492/nyhet.html  
http://stoppamachokulturen.nu/las-mer-om-kampanjen/


¿Por qué los sindicatos son tan machistas?, Siliva Cruz, El Español, 05.03.2016  
http://www.elespanol.com/ocio/mujer/20160304/106989504_0.html

Putting Union Gender Equality Policy into Practice in South Africa: The Role of Transformational Leadership, Nina Benjamin, the Labor Research Service, commissioned by Solidarity Center and Gender at Work, South Africa

Actualidad política, económica y social “En América Latina las certidumbres tienen patas cortas” Punto 1.; Federaciones y Coordinadoras (Transnacionales y Sectoriales) Punto 5; Comité Latinoamericano de la Mujer de la UITA (Clamu), “Más mujeres, más sindicato” Punto 7, Documents provided by IUF Latin America

Safe farms, safe workers, safe communities, Safety and environmental standards on plantations and farms in Africa, IUF African OHSE project, International Union of Food, Agricultural, Hotel, Restaurant, Catering, Tobacco, and Allied Workers’ Associations (IUF), March 2015

Skadlig machokultur i byggbranschen, Expressen, 26 juni 2015  
http://www.expressen.se/debatt/skadlig-machokultur-i-byggbranschen/

The Transformation of Work: Challenges and Strategies, Putting Union Gender Equality Policy into Practice in South Africa: The Role of Transformational Leadership, Solidarity Center


Women at Work, Safety, health and environment (SHE), BWI
Annex 3 – Interviewed and consulted persons

Persons marked with C have not been interviewed but consulted over emails.

Tomas Agnemo, Män för Jämställdhet, Sweden
Omara Amuko, regional coordinator work environment project, rural workers, IUF, based in Uganda
Erik Andersson, IF Metall, Sweden
Nina Benhjamin, Gender Research Co-ordinator of the Labor Research Service South Africa (C.)
Joa Bergold, LO, Sweden
Barbro Budin, Gender Equality and Projects Officer IUF
Igor Díaz López, Secretary of Education, Sintracarbón, Colombia
Ina Eriksson, Lärarförbundet, Sweden
Sofia Eriksson, Kommunal, Sweden
Rafael Felix, former Secretary of Gender Secretariat at Asociación Dominicana de Profesores, Dominican Republic
Iván García Suárez, Gender consultant on masculinities, Advisor at Instituto Colombiano de Bienestar Familiar ICBF, Colombia
Marcus Gustavsson, Vision in Gothenburg, Sweden
Dr. Jasper Goss, Projects Coordinator, Public Services International (PSI) (Dr. Goss is based in London)
Ulrika Hagström, TCO, Sweden
Fanny Högrell, IF Metall, Sweden
Gerardo Iglesias Iglesias, Regional secretary, IUF, Latin America, based in Uruguay
Mr Joseph Liyali, Wangwa Farms, Zambia
Mopholosi Morokong, coordinator for a work environment project, rural workers, IUF, South Africa
Aaron Kabwe Mwenya, xx, Zambia
Malin Rosén, Studieenheten, IF Metall Göteborg, Sweden (C.)
Sahra Ryklief, Secretary General of the International Federation of Workers’ Education Associations, South Africa (C.)
Adwoa Sakyi, Coordinator Africa Women’s Project/Gender network, IUF
Ghassan Slabiy, Regional coordinator, Middle East Region, Public Services International (PSI) based in Lebanon
Qamar Ul Hassan, national coordinator, IUF Pakistan
Emmanuel Yabani, Principal Education Officer for Industrial and Commercial Workers Union (ICU), Ghana
Annex 4– Interview guides

Intervjuguide (Swedish)

1. Vilken typ av jämställdhetsprojekt har ni pågående eller nyligen avslutade?
2. Har ni använt metoder för att särskilt engagera män och öka deras deltagande i jämställdhetsarbetet?
3. Hur har mäns engagemang och deltagande sett ut generellt i den typen av projekt?
4. Vilka exempel har ni, om några, på projekt, eller aktiviteter, där män utmärkt sig som förkämpar för kvinnors rättigheter/ökad jämställdhet? Utmärker sig vissa sakfrågor? Utmärker sig vissa sektorer/branscher eller regioner/länder?
5. Har ni haft några jämställdhetsprojekt som riktat in sig särskilt på män, mansroller, maskuliniteter (som övergripande tema eller som del av en större insats)? Om ja, vem är/var er partner och vilka är er erfarenheter?
6. Har du tips på personer som vore bra att kontakta för att få veta mer om dessa projekt?
7. Känner du till andra fackförbund än de ni samarbetar med som jobbat med manliga förebilder/förkämpar (male champions)?
8. Känner du till något material som skulle vara intressant för mig att titta närmare på (rapporter, utvärderingar, metodmaterial, etc.)

Interview guide – Male gender equality champions

1. Looking back, what made you engage in gender equality issues? Can you mention the driving factors, the burning issues?
2. Did you have any male role models in your union (or elsewhere), and/or did you engage together with other male unionists?
3. How have you as a male champion collaborated with women working for gender equality?
4. How do you see your own influence over other men (and women)?
5. What methods would you recommend to other men who want to get engaged?
6. What methods would you recommend to women activists and (women) gender networks at the work place/in the union who seek to engage more men in their work?
7. Sector/branch specific issues regarding men and gender equality.
8. Request for relevant material, resources, reports, etc.

Interview guide – gender project coordinators (or similar)

1. Tell me about the background of the project.
   A) How did you decide to work specifically with gender equality and men in your union? or
   B) To reach men was not the main focus in this project, but you still managed to engage men. How did that happen?
2. What methods did you use? What worked? What did not work?
3. What resources did you have (role models, manuals, reports from pilot cases, etc.)?
4. How, and on what issues, would you say that men affiliates engage in gender equality work?
5. Have your union worked with masculinities in any way? If yes, what methods have you used? What was the response from members and other actors involved/targeted?
6. What are the main lessons learned from the initiative?
7. Sector/branch specific issues regarding men and gender equality.
8. Request for relevant material, resources, reports, etc.
9. Do you know of any other union initiatives working with male champions/role models/masculinities, etc.?